*The Practical Origins of Ideas* by Matthieu Queloz – Chapter 2

Andrew Plum and Jonathan Stark

1. On page 31, Queloz says the approaches genealogy, pragmatism, and naturalism share a reputation for being reductive. Is there a good reason for this reputation? He also says pragmatic genealogy, which is a combination of the three aforementioned approaches, is not reductive. If there is good reason to think genealogy, pragmatism, and naturalism are reductive on their own, how can Queloz claim the combination of them to be not reductive? Why can genealogies without pragmatism and naturalism be reductive?
2. How is the pragmatic genealogical combination of naturalism, pragmatism, and genealogy a stepping point for going from one end to the other end of the genealogical spectrum Queloz describes in chapter 1?
3. This chapter focused primarily on the benefits of pragmatic genealogy. What are some of the drawbacks of pragmatic genealogy? When would pragmatic genealogy be the preferred method of analysis? When would conceptual analysis be the preferred approach to understanding concepts?
4. Can pragmatic genealogy and conceptual analysis be performed meaningfully together? If so, what ways does pragmatic genealogy complement traditional conceptual analysis? In what ways do they limit each other when done together?
5. Can the conclusions that have been reached through pragmatic genealogy conflict with the ideas that have stemmed from conceptual analysis? If so, which conclusions are preferred? Or is this not possible?
6. Queloz says all pragmatic genealogy is a function-first approach. Are all function-first approaches genealogical? If not, what are other approaches which are function-first?
7. According to Queloz, why is pragmatic genealogy the reverse engineering variant most well-suited for responsible conceptual engineering? Do you agree with this claim?
8. Queloz brings up the trial of Oscar Wilde as being a good example of the distinction between justification and vindication. Can you think of another example which illustrates the distinction well?